



**Notice is hereby given that on Wednesday, January 15, 2025, the Board of Directors of Tarrant Appraisal District (TAD) will meet in open session beginning at 8:00 a.m. at the Tarrant Appraisal District boardroom, 2500 Handley Ederville Rd, Fort Worth, TX**

This meeting and supporting material will be available at [www.tad.org](http://www.tad.org) and TAD's YouTube and Facebook channels

## **AGENDA**

### **Swearing in of five entity appointed members**

- 1. Call to Order**
- 2. Verify Presence of Quorum and Posting of Meeting Notice**
- 3. Pledges of Allegiance**
- 4. Invocation**
- 5. Recognize Visitors; Hear Public Comments**
- 6. Special Presentation from the Office of Representative David Cook**
- 7. Action Items**
  - a) Deliberate and act on the election of a chair and secretary of the TAD Board of Directors
  - b) Resolution 2025-1 In recognition and appreciation of service by Vince Puente
  - c) Resolution 2025-2 In recognition and appreciation of service by Gary Losada
  - d) Consent Agenda Items:
    - i. Action regarding approval of Board of Directors meeting minutes from December 13, 2024
  - e) Consider Responses to Invitation for Bids for 2025 Print Mail Notice Service and authorize Chief Appraiser to use selected vendors for printing and mailing services
  - f) Board of Directors Policy Manual – potential changes for 2025
- 8. Information Items**
  - a) Introduction of Dr. McIlvain and Report as Taxpayer Liaison Officer (TLO)
  - b) Report by Chief Appraiser
    - i. Drawing for Term Lengths for new Board Members
    - ii. Public Speaking Engagements
    - iii. CAMA Conversion
    - iv. Technology Update
    - v. Updated Sales Ratios
- 9. Propose Future Agenda Items; Set Next Meeting Date; Adjourn**

Next meeting date: 8:00 AM Friday, February 21, 2025, at Tarrant Appraisal District, 2500 Handley-Ederville Rd, Fort Worth, Texas

Joe Don Bobbitt  
Executive Director/Chief Appraiser

The public is invited to address the Board during the Public Comments period under Agenda Item 5 regarding any item on the Agenda and other issues under the Board's jurisdiction. During the Public Comments period, the Chairman will allow each speaker five minutes but may expand the time as needed if doing so will not interfere with the Board's completing its business and adjourning its meeting at a reasonable time. The Board may refuse to hear comments on subjects not reasonably related to items on the Agenda, to policies and procedures of Tarrant Appraisal District or Tarrant Appraisal Review Board, or to other issues under the Board's jurisdiction. The Board may not respond to comments regarding items not on the Agenda.

**Action Item 7(a): Deliberate and act on the election of a chair and secretary of the TAD Board of Directors**

**Action Item 7(b): Resolution 2025-1 In recognition and appreciation of service by Vince Puente**

**RESOLUTION 2025-1  
THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
TARRANT APPRAISAL DISTRICT**

In recognition and appreciation of service by Vince Puente, Sr.

**WHEREAS**, the Texas Property Tax Code Section 6.03 outlines the representational appointment process for appraisal district board members by which elected governing bodies of the boards within Tarrant County entities vote to appoint members;

**WHEREAS**, Mr. Puente was nominated and appointed to fill a vacancy on the Board on May 12, 2023 and completed that term on December 31, 2023;

**WHEREAS**, Vince Puente received nominations from the Cities of Bedford, Colleyville, Haltom City, Haslet, Keller, Lakeside, Mansfield, North Richland Hills, Southlake, and Carroll ISD, Grapevine-Colleyville ISD, Keller ISD and Tarrant County College District in 2023 and therefore was appointed and served a 2024 term;

**WHEREAS**, Mr. Puente was elected by the board and served as Board Chair for 2024;

**WHEREAS**, Mr. Puente completed his terms of service as a volunteer on the Board of Directors of Tarrant Appraisal District;

Therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, that this body formally acknowledges and extends its appreciation to Mr. Puente for his outstanding contributions, exemplary service, and unwavering commitment to Tarrant Appraisal District.

**FURTHER RESOLVED**, that a copy of this resolution be presented to Mr. Puente as a token of our gratitude and recognition.

Adopted on January , 2025

---

Chairman

---

Secretary

**Action Item 7(c): Resolution 2025-2 In recognition and appreciation of service by Gary Losada**

**RESOLUTION 2025-2**  
**THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS**  
**TARRANT APPRAISAL DISTRICT**

In recognition and appreciation of service by Mr. Losada

**WHEREAS**, the Texas Property Tax Code Section 6.03 outlines the representational appointment process for appraisal district board members by which elected governing bodies of the boards within Tarrant County entities vote to appoint members;

**WHEREAS**, the City of Colleyville nominated Gary Losada in 2019 and he was appointed for the 2020-2021 term;

**WHEREAS**, Gary Losada received votes from the Cities of Bedford, Burleson, Colleyville, Haltom City, Haslet, Hurst, Keller, Lakeside, Southlake, Watauga, White Settlement, and the following ISDs: Carroll, Grapevine-Colleyville, HEB, Keller, and Mansfield, and the Tarrant County College District and therefore was appointed and served his 2024 term;

**WHEREAS**, Mr. Losada served as the ARB Subcommittee Chair in 2024 and completed three years of service as a volunteer on the Board of Directors of Tarrant Appraisal District;

Therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, that this body formally acknowledges and extends its appreciation to Mr. Losada for his outstanding contributions, exemplary service, and unwavering commitment to Tarrant Appraisal District.

**FURTHER RESOLVED**, that a copy of this resolution be presented to Mr. Losada as a token of our gratitude and recognition.

Adopted on January , 2025

\_\_\_\_\_  
Chairman

\_\_\_\_\_  
Secretary

**Action Item 7(d)(i): Action regarding approval of Board of Directors meeting minutes from December 13, 2024**

**Staff Recommendation:**

**Approve Board of Directors meeting minutes from December 13, 2024, as presented**



**Tarrant Appraisal District  
Board of Directors Meeting Minutes  
Friday, December 13, 2024**

This meeting was conducted in compliance with the Open Meetings Act as written in the statute. A quorum of the members of the Board attended in person at the Tarrant Appraisal District boardroom, 2500 Handley Ederville Rd, Fort Worth, Texas.

These minutes are a summary of the only subjects the Board addressed and the actions it took. For details, see the agenda, supporting documents and video posted on TAD's website at this URL: <https://www.tad.org/board-of-directors> and TAD's YouTube and Facebook channels.

**Members Present:**

Mr. Alan Blaylock  
Mr. Matt Bryant  
Ms. Wendy Burgess, Tax Assessor Collector  
Mr. Rich DeOtte  
Mr. Eric Morris  
Mr. Gary Losada  
Ms. Gloria Peña, Secretary  
Mr. Vince Puente, Chair  
Ms. Callie Rigney

**Also Participating:**

Mr. Joe Don Bobbitt, Chief Appraiser  
Mr. Brad Patrick, Director of Administration  
Mr. Matthew Tepper, TAD Board Attorney

Chair Puente called the meeting to order at 8:02am, verified a quorum was present and the notice was posted timely. After pledges and invocation, the board took up the following agenda items:

**5. Public Comments-** Mr. Bennett, Mr. Dodson, Ms. Syed, Mr. Crouch & County Administrator Merritt spoke.

**6. Information Items**

- a) Report by Taxpayer Liaison Officer**
  - i.** ARB complaints, comments, and suggestions report for Comptroller
  - ii.** TLO Monthly Report

Ms. Jacobson was unable to attend. The report she provided was reviewed.

- b) Report by Chief Appraiser**
  - i.** Public Speaking Engagements

- ii. Customer Service Surveys
- iii. CAMA Conversion
- iv. Technology Update
- v. Updated Sales Ratio

Chief Bobbitt presented his report and the materials were provided in the agenda packet.

## 7. Action Items

### a) Consent Agenda Items:

- i. **Action regarding approval of Board of Directors meeting minutes from November 8, 2024**

This item was removed from consent by Mr. DeOtte to after 7(e). Ms. Pena moved to approve the minutes as presented and Mr. Blaylock seconded. The motion passed 8-0 as Mr. DeOtte abstained.

- iv. **Action regarding approval of contract for McCreary, Veselka, Bragg & Allen, PC to serve as the legal counsel for the TAD Board of Directors**

This item was removed from consent by Mr. Puente to after 7(e). Mr. Puente moved to approve the contract with a 90-day notice added and Mr. Tepper agreed to add this to the contract. Mr. DeOtte seconded, and the motion passed 9-0.

- ii. **Action regarding approval of Resolution to modify the number of Regular and Auxiliary ARB Members**
- iii. **Action regarding adoption of 2025 Tarrant Appraisal District Investment Policy**
- v. **Action regarding consent to Agricultural Advisory Board member appointments**
- vi. **Action regarding approval for Chief Appraiser to execute contract for Aerial Imagery Services with Pictometry International Corp (d/b/a EagleView) as part of Interlocal Agreement with Tarrant County and Tarrant County 9-1-1 District**
- vii. **Action regarding approval for Chief Appraiser to renew contract for GIS consulting services**
- viii. **Action regarding approval for Chief Appraiser to renew contract for DocuSign for an electronic signature solution**
- ix. **Action regarding approval to contract with Improving Enterprises for temp-to-hire IS staff member**

Ms. Pena moved to approve staff recommendations for remaining consent agenda items 2-3 & 5-9 as presented and Mr. DeOtte seconded. The motion passed 9-0.

- b) **Consider and possible action on penalty & interest waiver requests for late allocation payments from taxing entities for good cause and possible refund of penalty & interest for entities already paid**
  - i. **City of Grand Prairie**

- ii. **Hurst-Eules-Bedford ISD**
- iii. **Keller ISD**
- iv. **City of Burleson**
- v. **Tarrant County**
- vi. **Tarrant County Hospital District**

After discussion, Mr. Puente moved to make a one-time exception based on the entity list on page 34 of those specific late fees, and we waive and/or refund penalties and interest fees to entities as presented and then notify all entities that we are going to enforce the policy going forward. The motion was seconded by Mr. DeOtte and failed, 3-6 with Mr. Puente, Mr. DeOtte, and Mr. Morris voting in favor and Mr. Blaylock, Mr. Bryant, Ms. Burgess, Mr. Losada, Ms. Pena, and Ms. Rigney voting against.

Ms. Rigney moved to waive penalties interest from all taxing entities and refund all penalties and interest already paid during calendar year 2024 including those listed on page 34 for a total of \$148,146.41 (calculated from page 44) from the general fund. Mr. DeOtte seconded, and the motion failed 3-6, with Mr. DeOtte, Mr. Morris, Ms. Rigney, voting in favor and Mr. Blaylock, Mr. Bryant, Ms. Burgess, Mr. Losada, Ms. Pena and Mr. Puente voting against.

After the two motions failed, no action was taken.

**c) Action regarding purchase of new payroll/HR software for 2025**

Mr. Blaylock moved to approve the staff recommendation as presented and Ms. Pena seconded the motion. It passed 9-0.

**d) Deliberation & action on options for committing unspent funds from 2024 Budget**

Mr. Blaylock moved to commit unspent funds as presented into the Building & Maintenance fund and Technology fund. Ms. Pena seconded. The motion passed 9-0.

**e) Consider and possible action concerning TAD's membership with the Texas Association of Appraisal Districts (TAAD)**

Mr. Morris moved to end TAD's membership with TAAD for 2025 and Ms. Rigney seconded. The motion passed 6-3, with Mr. Bryant, Mr. DeOtte, Mr. Losada, Mr. Morris, Mr. Puente, and Ms. Rigney voting for and Blaylock, Burgess, and Pena voting against.

**f) Resolution 2024-5 In recognition and appreciation of service by Rich DeOtte**

Mr. Losada moved to approve the resolution as presented and Ms. Pena seconded. The motion passed 9-0.

**8. Recess to Executive/Closed Session Pursuant to the Following Part(s) of the Texas Open Meetings Act Government Code Ch. 551, for the Following Purposes:**

- Section 551.076 – Deliberation regarding the deployment, or specific occasions for implementation, of security personnel or devices related to Board of Directors meetings
- Section 551.074 – Deliberation regarding the annual job performance evaluations of the Chief Appraiser
- Section 551.074 – Deliberation regarding the annual job performance evaluation and appointment of the Taxpayer Liaison Officer for 2025

The board recessed to Executive Session at 10:34am.

**9. Return to Open Session for Possible Action on Items Deliberated on in Executive/ Closed Session**

The board returned from Executive Session at 1:26pm.

Mr. DeOtte moved to authorize the Chief Appraiser to offer Dr. Elizabeth McIlvaine the position as the Taxpayer Liaison Officer for 2025 with compensation as budgeted. Mr. Losada seconded, and the motion passed 9-0.

Mr. Puente moved to give the Chief Appraiser a base salary increase of 2.5% effective 2/1/25. Ms. Pena seconded, and the motion passed 9-0.

**10. Propose Future Agenda Items; Set Next Meeting Date; Adjourn**

- a) Next Published Meeting date is at 8am on January 10<sup>th</sup>, 2025, at Tarrant Appraisal District, 2500 Handley Ederville Rd, Fort Worth, Texas.
- a) The board was asked to submit requested future agenda items to the Chairman & Chief Appraiser by email no later than 8-days prior to next scheduled meeting (to allow time for draft process and posting).
- a) The meeting adjourned at 1:30pm.

---

Gloria Peña, Board Secretary

---

Vince Puente, Board Chair

**Action Item 7(e): Consider Responses to Invitation for Bids for 2025 Print Mail Notice Service and authorize Chief Appraiser to use selected vendors for printing and mailing services**

The invitation to bid included fourteen tax code mandated mailing scenarios which were described in detail so as to get the most accurate, representative, and competitive bids possible from such a process. Additionally a generic print services bid sheet was included to cover other large printing and or mailing jobs which are not as significant or predictable as the required mailings such as:

- Course materials
- ARB hearing notices
- ARB board orders
- Forms for request at our front counter

Staff recommend an award to Variverge for the large print jobs and John Sons Press for smaller jobs (primarily listed on Schedule 15 Generic print services). In the case of this bid its important that TAD not be authorized to a specific total dollar amount because many factors can cause the total cost change:

- If the board chooses to send appraisal notices for all real properties
- The unknown number of homestead letters generated by the homestead audit
- Whether the cost of first class and certified mail is increased by USPS
- The inclusion of other mailings which are not specifically outlined within this bid
- Potential for unfunded mandates

**Bid Results For  
Printing and Mailing Services**

Vendor	Masters Touch	Variverge	John Sons Press
<b>Total Cost Std. Jobs</b>	\$ 236,741.65	\$ 158,959.85	\$ 168,905.01
<b>Total Generic Print Jobs</b>	\$ 65,725.00	\$ 49,174.31	\$ 45,393.60
Vendors Plan / Method	20	20	20
Experience	20	25	15
References Similar to TAD	12	15	10
Contract Terms	9	9	9
Any Other Relevant Factors	10	10	10
Cost	0	20	15
<b>Bid Score</b>	<b>71</b>	<b>99</b>	<b>79</b>
Notes			
Electronic Notice Service	Yes	Yes	Not offered
Existing Tad Vendor	No	No	Yes

**Staff Recommendation:**

**Authorize Chief Appraise to enter into contracts with both Variverge and John Sons Press, allowing the district to utilize the most cost-effective vendor for each print job.**

**Discussion Item 7(f): Board of Directors Policy Manual – potential changes for 2025**

**Information Item 8(a): Introduction of Dr. McIlvain and Report as Taxpayer Liaison Officer (TLO)**

Elizabeth McIlvain Ed. D.

Professional Attributes submitted to TAD BOD in support of candidacy for Tarrant Appraisal District Liaison Officer (TLO), December, 2024:

Distinguished career as education leader in two states, lauding awards as state level Outstanding Administrator & National Distinguished Principal.

Empathetic listening, number one most desirable leadership skill.

Creative Problem Solving, exercising unique approaches within procedural guidelines.

Six years of integrated ARB experience, including 2024 ARB Chair including 94.6% 2024 Certification, generated as unprecedented level of achievement of protests resolved.

Principle - centered leadership skills improved ARB levels of positive response to Property Owner & DCAD Initiatives by prioritizing existing organizational & situational variables.

Supplementation of quantitative multiple criteria data analysis with qualitative research techniques to provide clustering of perspectives concerning types & substance of taxpayer complaints to assist BOD working comparative knowledge about types of existing complaints.



**Information Item 8(b): Report by Chief Appraiser**

**Public Speaking Engagements:**

- December 16, 2024 Azle ISD
- December 17, 2024 City of Arlington
- January 16, 2025 Hosting Cybersecurity and CAMA conversion discussion for Entity IT staff
- Appraisal Outreach Workshops will start being scheduled through May

**CAMA Conversion:**

- Weekly Meetings with vendor
- Weekly mapped data drops
- Resolving on-going development integrations with third party tools
- Collaborative effort with other counties with future development and best practices

TASK	Sept 2024	Oct 2024	Nov 2024	Dec 2024	Jan 2025
RFP Process and Contract Negotiations	[Blue bar spanning Sept 2024 to Oct 2024]				
<b>Contract Milestone 1</b> Creation Knowledge Base and Key User Accounts	[Green bar spanning Oct 2024 to Nov 2024]				
<b>Contract Milestone 2</b> Configure of Base TP Environment with Sample Data	[Green bar spanning Nov 2024 to Dec 2024]				
<b>Contract Milestone 3</b> Conversion to shut down Aumentum / Iterative Conversions	[Green bar spanning Oct 2024 to Nov 2024]				
<b>Phase 1</b> Online Self-Learning Courses, Preliminary Data Mapping, Preliminary Conversion	[Blue bar spanning Oct 2024 to Dec 2024]				
Data Validation & Iterative Conversion	[Green bar spanning Dec 2024 to Jan 2025]				
<b>Phase 2</b> Perform Current Year Conversion, Validate, Balance, Go-Live	[Green bar spanning Dec 2024 to Jan 2025]				

**Technology Update:**

- Homestead Audit Update
  - TAD's data has been successfully loaded into TrueRoll
  - The project is on track with expected delivery of the platform to TAD staff the week of 1/6
  - A training session will be planned for later next week.
  - Application Vetter configuration will take place following the training session to review online and paper-based applications for new homestead exemptions.



- Staff considering Board Agenda Software
  - Available Features:
    - Multi-user capability with rights and views
    - Draft and approval process
    - Publishing agenda, packet and video to website
    - Preparation of Minutes
    - Timestamps on video for agenda items
    - Vote tracking
  - Products reviewed and estimated cost range from \$4,000-\$17,000:
    - CivicPlus
    - TechShare
    - BoardBook
    - OnBoard
    - Granicus
  - Prefer IT subcommittee or provide input and review offerings

**Ratios:**

Sales From January	Nov Median	Dec Median	Jan Median	Nov WM	Dec WM	Jan WM
Azle ISD	.91	.90	.90	.89	.92	.92
Carroll ISD	.88	.88	.88	.85	.88	.88
Everman ISD	.89	.87	.86	.90	.91	.92
Fort Worth ISD	.92	.92	.92	.89	.93	.94
Grapevine-Colleyville ISD	.93	.93	.92	.89	.94	.93
<b>Sales From July</b>						
Castleberry ISD	.92	.88	.89	.90	.92	.92

ISD	Count of PIN	Sum of TotalValue	Sum of StatedSalePrice	Median Ratio	WM
ARLINGTON ISD	1867	\$ 603,925,689	\$ 630,862,168	0.95	0.96
AZLE ISD	319	\$ 108,628,095	\$ 117,942,131	0.90	0.92
BIRDVILLE ISD	1226	\$ 425,580,333	\$ 436,337,244	0.95	0.98
BURLESON ISD	229	\$ 77,563,817	\$ 79,484,734	0.99	0.98
CARROLL ISD	333	\$ 477,555,571	\$ 542,272,921	0.88	0.88
CASTLEBERRY ISD	150	\$ 44,450,903	\$ 43,775,696	0.95	1.02
CROWLEY ISD	1270	\$ 413,047,778	\$ 441,278,097	0.95	0.94
EAGLE MTN-SAGINAW ISD	1867	\$ 636,599,247	\$ 683,900,044	0.95	0.93
EVERMAN ISD	202	\$ 50,529,440	\$ 55,042,474	0.86	0.92
FORT WORTH ISD	3555	\$ 1,346,156,615	\$ 1,433,234,925	0.92	0.94
GRAPEVINE-COLLEYVILLE ISD	604	\$ 445,444,208	\$ 477,161,596	0.92	0.93
HURST-EULESS-BEDFORD ISD	1153	\$ 435,725,467	\$ 463,866,487	0.94	0.94
KELLER ISD	1653	\$ 894,890,631	\$ 924,213,880	0.96	0.97
KENNEDALE ISD	171	\$ 58,632,998	\$ 62,195,520	0.97	0.94
LAKE WORTH ISD	117	\$ 31,801,699	\$ 32,161,154	0.96	0.99
MANSFIELD ISD	1207	\$ 508,836,730	\$ 539,670,933	0.97	0.94
NORTHWEST ISD	892	\$ 389,835,914	\$ 418,476,800	0.95	0.93
WHITE SETTLEMENT ISD	455	\$ 134,581,105	\$ 138,285,819	0.95	0.97
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>17270</b>	<b>\$ 7,083,786,240</b>	<b>\$ 7,520,162,623</b>	<b>0.94</b>	<b>0.94</b>